

**ORDER SHEET****WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL****Present-**

**The Hon'ble Justice Ranjit Kumar Bag  
& The Hon'ble Subesh Kumar Das**

**Case No –OA 341 OF 2017**

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal Vs The State of West Bengal & Ors.**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
<p>12 04.04.2019</p>	<p>For the Applicant : Mr. A. Banerjee, Learned Advocate.</p> <p>For the Respondents : Mr. B.P. Roy, Learned Advocate.</p> <p>For the AG (A &amp; E), W.B. : Mr. B. Mitra, Departmental Representative.</p> <p>The applicant has prayed for direction upon the respondents for refund of the amount of money deducted from the retiring Gratuity of the applicant.</p> <p>It appears from the materials on record that the applicant retired from the post of Assistant Director of Textiles (Sericulture) on January 31, 2014 from the establishment of the Joint Director, Directorate of Textiles, Sericulture Division, Government of West Bengal. The contention of the applicant is that a sum of Rs.2,80,554/- was deducted from the retiring Gratuity of the applicant on the ground of excess payment during the period of service of the applicant due to wrong fixation of pay. The further contention of the applicant is that he received the balance amount of gratuity to the tune of Rs.3,19,446/- through A/C payee cheque on February 18, 2014. The grievance of the applicant is that a sum of Rs.2,80,554/- should not have been deducted from the retiring gratuity after retirement of the applicant from service.</p>	

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. &amp; Ors.

Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	<p>Having heard Learned Counsel representing both the parties and the authorised representative of the Respondent A.G., West Bengal, we find that there was excess payment of Rs.2,80,554/- to the applicant due to wrong fixation of pay and as such the said amount was recovered from the retiring gratuity of the applicant after retirement from service. The Hon'ble Supreme Court has summarised the following situations in paragraph 18 of the judgment of "State of Punjab v Rafiq Masih" reported in (2015) 4 SCC 334, when recovery of excess payment by the state respondents would not be permissible in law :</p> <p><i>".... (i) Recovery from the employees belonging to Class III and Class IV service (or Group C and Group D service);</i></p> <p><i>(ii) Recovery from the retired employees, or the employees who are due to retire within one year of the order of recovery;</i></p> <p><i>(iii) Recovery from the employees, when the excess payment has been made for a period in excess of 5 years, before the order of recovery is issued;</i></p>	

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. &amp; Ors.

Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	<p><i>(iv) Recovery in cases where an employee has wrongfully been required to discharge duties of a higher post, and has been paid accordingly, even though he should have rightfully been required to work against an inferior post;</i></p> <p><i>(v) In any other case, where the Court arrives at the conclusion that recovery if made from the employee, would be iniquitous or harsh or arbitrary to such an extent as would far outweigh the equitable balance of the employer's right to recover."</i></p> <p>We have laid down in the case of "Bireswar Dey v State of West Bengal &amp; Ors." (OA-1045 of 2014 decided on August 20, 2018), that state respondents cannot invoke the provisions of Rule 140(2) of the West Bengal Services (Death-cum-Retirement Benefit) Rules, 1971 for recovery of excess payment of pay and allowances from the retiring Gratuity of the Government employee, particularly when the recovery of over payment from retiring gratuity is done after prolonged period from the date on which the said recovery would have been effected and thereby causing hardship to the applicant to such an extent, which will outweigh equitable balance of the right of the Government to recover the same.</p>	

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
Rajib	<p>By following the decision of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in the case of "State of Punjab v Rafiq Masih" (Supra) and the decision of "Bireswar Dey v State of West Bengal &amp; Ors." (Supra), we are of the view that the state respondents are bound to refund an amount of Rs.2,80,554/- to the applicant.</p> <p>In view of our above findings, the respondent no. 2, Commissioner of Textiles and Sericulture, Directorate of Textiles, Sericulture Division, West Bengal is directed to refund Rs.2,80,554/- to the applicant within a period of 12 (twelve) weeks from the date of communication of the order.</p> <p>With the above direction, the original application stands <b>disposed of.</b></p> <p>Let a plain copy of the order be supplied to all the parties.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>S. K. DAS</b> <b>MEMBER(A)</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>R. K. BAG</b> <b>MEMBER(J)</b></p>	

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3



**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. &amp; Ors.

Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
Rajib		

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3



**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3

**ORDER SHEET**

Form No.

**Md. Bulbul Hossain Mondal –V- State of W.B. & Ors.**Case No. **OA-341 of 2017**

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3